

CADTH RAPID RESPONSE REPORT: REFERENCE LIST

Community Water Fluoridation: Clinical and Cost-Effectiveness

Service Line: Rapid Response Service

Version: 1.0

Publication Date: March 27, 2017

Report Length: 9 Pages



Authors: Calvin Young, Andrea Ryce

Cite As: Community water fluoridation: clinical and cost-effectiveness. Ottawa: CADTH; 2017 Mar. (CADTH rapid response report: reference list).

Acknowledgments:

Disclaimer: The information in this document is intended to help Canadian health care decision-makers, health care professionals, health systems leaders, and policy-makers make well-informed decisions and thereby improve the quality of health care services. While patients and others may access this document, the document is made available for informational purposes only and no representations or warranties are made with respect to its fitness for any particular purpose. The information in this document should not be used as a substitute for professional medical advice or as a substitute for the application of clinical judgment in respect of the care of a particular patient or other professional judgment in any decision-making process. The Canadian Agency for Drugs and Technologies in Health (CADTH) does not endorse any information, drugs, therapies, treatments, products, processes, or services.

While care has been taken to ensure that the information prepared by CADTH in this document is accurate, complete, and up-to-date as at the applicable date the material was first published by CADTH, CADTH does not make any guarantees to that effect. CADTH does not guarantee and is not responsible for the quality, currency, propriety, accuracy, or reasonableness of any statements, information, or conclusions contained in any third-party materials used in preparing this document. The views and opinions of third parties published in this document do not necessarily state or reflect those of CADTH.

CADTH is not responsible for any errors, omissions, injury, loss, or damage arising from or relating to the use (or misuse) of any information, statements, or conclusions contained in or implied by the contents of this document or any of the source materials.

This document may contain links to third-party websites. CADTH does not have control over the content of such sites. Use of third-party sites is governed by the third-party website owners' own terms and conditions set out for such sites. CADTH does not make any guarantee with respect to any information contained on such third-party sites and CADTH is not responsible for any injury, loss, or damage suffered as a result of using such third-party sites. CADTH has no responsibility for the collection, use, and disclosure of personal information by third-party sites.

Subject to the aforementioned limitations, the views expressed herein are those of CADTH and do not necessarily represent the views of Canada's federal, provincial, or territorial governments or any third party supplier of information.

This document is prepared and intended for use in the context of the Canadian health care system. The use of this document outside of Canada is done so at the user's own risk.

This disclaimer and any questions or matters of any nature arising from or relating to the content or use (or misuse) of this document will be governed by and interpreted in accordance with the laws of the Province of Ontario and the laws of Canada applicable therein, and all proceedings shall be subject to the exclusive jurisdiction of the courts of the Province of Ontario, Canada.

The copyright and other intellectual property rights in this document are owned by CADTH and its licensors. These rights are protected by the Canadian *Copyright Act* and other national and international laws and agreements. Users are permitted to make copies of this document for non-commercial purposes only, provided it is not modified when reproduced and appropriate credit is given to CADTH and its licensors.

About CADTH: CADTH is an independent, not-for-profit organization responsible for providing Canada's health care decision-makers with objective evidence to help make informed decisions about the optimal use of drugs, medical devices, diagnostics, and procedures in our health care system.

Funding: CADTH receives funding from Canada's federal, provincial, and territorial governments, with the exception of Quebec.



Research Questions

- 1. What is the clinical effectiveness regarding the use of community water fluoridation?
- 2. What is the cost-effectiveness regarding the use of community water fluoridation?

Key Findings

Three systematic reviews, one systematic review of economic evaluations, one metaanalysis, nineteen non-randomized studies, and eight economic evaluations were identified regarding the clinical effectiveness, safety, or cost-effectiveness of community water fluoridation.

Methods

A limited literature search was conducted on key resources including PubMed, The Cochrane Library, University of York Centre for Reviews and Dissemination (CRD) databases, Canadian and major international health technology agencies, as well as a focused Internet search. Methodological filters were applied to limit retrieval to health technology assessments, systematic reviews, meta-analyses, randomized controlled trials, non-randomized studies and economic studies. Where possible, retrieval was limited to the human population. The search was also limited to English language documents published between January 1, 2012 and March 19, 2017. Internet links were provided, where available.

Selection Criteria

One reviewer screened citations and selected studies based on the inclusion criteria presented in Table 1.

Table 1: Selection Criteria

Population	Children and adults living in communities
Intervention	Community water fluoridation
Comparator	No community water fluoridation
Outcomes	Q1: Clinical effectiveness and safety Q2: Cost-effectiveness
Study Designs	Health technology assessments, systematic reviews, meta-analyses, randomized controlled trials, non-randomized studies, economic evaluations



Results

Rapid Response reports are organized so that the higher quality evidence is presented first. Therefore, health technology assessment reports, systematic reviews, and meta-analyses are presented first. These are followed by randomized controlled trials, non-randomized studies, and economic evaluations.

Three systematic reviews, one systematic review of economic evaluations, one metaanalysis, nineteen non-randomized studies, and eight economic evaluations were identified regarding the clinical effectiveness, safety, or cost-effectiveness of community water fluoridation. No relevant health technology assessments or randomized controlled trials were identified.

Additional references of potential interest are provided in the appendix.

Health Technology Assessments

No literature identified.

Systematic Reviews and Meta-analyses

- McLaren L, Singhal S. Does cessation of community water fluoridation lead to an increase in tooth decay? A systematic review of published studies. J Epidemiol Community Health [Internet]. 2016 Sep [cited 2017 Mar 19];70(9):934-40. Available from: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC5013153
 PubMed: PM27177581
- Taghipour N, Amini H, Mosaferi M, Yunesian M, Pourakbar M, Taghipour H. National and sub-national drinking water fluoride concentrations and prevalence of fluorosis and of decayed, missed, and filled teeth in Iran from 1990 to 2015: a systematic review. Environ Sci Pollut Res Int. 2016 Mar;23(6):5077-98.
 PubMed: PM26841772
- Iheozor-Ejiofor Z, Worthington HV, Walsh T, O'Malley L, Clarkson JE, Macey R, et al. Water fluoridation for the prevention of dental caries. Cochrane Database Syst Rev. 2015 Jun 18;(6):CD010856.
 PubMed: PM26092033
- Yin XH, Huang GL, Lin DR, Wan CC, Wang YD, Song JK, et al. Exposure to fluoride in drinking water and hip fracture risk: a meta-analysis of observational studies. PLoS One [Internet]. 2015 [cited 2017 Mar 19];10(5):e0126488. Available from: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4447426 PubMed: PM26020536
- Marino RJ, Khan AR, Morgan M. Systematic review of publications on economic evaluations of caries prevention programs. Caries Res [Internet]. 2013 [cited 2017 Mar 19];47(4):265-72. Available from: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4813796
 PubMed: PM23407213



Randomized Controlled Trials

No literature identified.

Non-Randomized Studies

 Archer NP, Napier TS, Villanacci JF. Fluoride exposure in public drinking water and childhood and adolescent osteosarcoma in Texas. Cancer Causes Control. 2016 Jul;27(7):863-8.

PubMed: PM27189068

- Peres MA, Peres KG, Barbato PR, Hofelmann DA. Access to fluoridated water and adult dental caries: a natural experiment. J Dent Res. 2016 Jul;95(8):868-74. PubMed: PM27053119
- Blinkhorn AS, Byun R, Johnson G, Metha P, Kay M, Lewis P. The dental health of primary school children living in fluoridated, pre-fluoridated and non-fluoridated communities in New South Wales, Australia. BMC Oral Health [Internet]. 2015 Jan 21 [cited 2017 Mar 19];15:9. Available from: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4324770
 PubMed: PM25604625
- Blinkhorn AS, Byun R, Mehta P, Kay M. A 4-year assessment of a new waterfluoridation scheme in New South Wales, Australia. Int Dent J. 2015 Jun;65(3):156-63. PubMed: PM25913418
- 10. Broadbent JM, Thomson WM, Ramrakha S, Moffitt TE, Zeng J, Foster Page LA, et al. Community water fluoridation and intelligence: prospective study in New Zealand. Am J Public Health [Internet]. 2015 Jan [cited 2017 Mar 19];105(1):72-6. Available from: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4265943
 PubMed: PM24832151
- 11. Crocombe LA, Brennan DS, Slade GD, Stewart JF, Spencer AJ. The effect of lifetime fluoridation exposure on dental caries experience of younger rural adults. Aust Dent J. 2015 Mar;60(1):30-7.

PubMed: PM25329426

- Do L, Spencer AJ. Contemporary multilevel analysis of the effectiveness of water fluoridation in Australia. Aust N Z J Public Health. 2015 Feb;39(1):44-50. <u>PubMed: PM25558897</u>
- 13. Khan SA, Singh RK, Navit S, Chadha D, Johri N, Navit P, et al. Relationship between dental fluorosis and intelligence quotient of school going children in and around Lucknow district: a cross-sectional study. J Clin Diagn Res. 2015 Nov;9(11):ZC10-ZC15.

PubMed: PM26673535

14. Klivitsky A, Tasher D, Stein M, Gavron E, Somekh E. Hospitalizations for dental infections: optimally versus nonoptimally fluoridated areas in Israel. J Am Dent Assoc. 2015 Mar;146(3):179-83.

PubMed: PM25726345



15. Koh R, Pukallus ML, Newman B, Foley M, Walsh LJ, Seow WK. Effects of water fluoridation on caries experience in the primary dentition in a high caries risk community in Queensland, Australia. Caries Res. 2015;49(2):184-91.

PubMed: PM25661315

16. Lalloo R, Jamieson LM, Ha D, Ellershaw A, Luzzi L. Does fluoride in the water close the dental caries gap between Indigenous and non-Indigenous children? Aust Dent J. 2015 Sep:60(3):390-6.

PubMed: PM25327814

17. Peckham S, Lowery D, Spencer S. Are fluoride levels in drinking water associated with hypothyroidism prevalence in England? A large observational study of GP practice data and fluoride levels in drinking water. J Epidemiol Community Health. 2015 Jul;69(7):619-24.

PubMed: PM25714098

18. Cho HJ, Lee HS, Paik DI, Bae KH. Association of dental caries with socioeconomic status in relation to different water fluoridation levels. Community Dent Oral Epidemiol. 2014 Dec;42(6):536-42.

PubMed: PM24890821

 Johnson NW, Lalloo R, Kroon J, Fernando S, Tut O. Effectiveness of water fluoridation in caries reduction in a remote Indigenous community in Far North Queensland. Aust Dent J. 2014 Sep;59(3):366-71.

PubMed: PM24820049

- 20. Sun L, Gao Y, Liu H, Zhang W, Ding Y, Li B, et al. An assessment of the relationship between excess fluoride intake from drinking water and essential hypertension in adults residing in fluoride endemic areas. Sci Total Environ. 2013 Jan 15;443:864-9. PubMed: PM23246666
- McLaren L, Emery JC. Drinking water fluoridation and oral health inequities in Canadian children. Can J Public Health. 2012 Feb 1;103(7 Suppl 1):eS49-eS56. PubMed: PM23618050
- 22. Megalamanegowdru J, Ankola AV, Vathar J, Vishwakarma P, Dhanappa KB, Balappanavar AY. Periodontal health status among permanent residents of low, optimum and high fluoride areas in Kolar District, India. Oral health prev dent. 2012;10(2):175-83.

PubMed: PM22763598

23. Mullen J, McGaffin J, Farvardin N, Brightman S, Haire C, Freeman R. Caries status in 16 year-olds with varying exposure to water fluoridation in Ireland. Community Dent Health. 2012 Dec;29(4):293-6.

PubMed: PM23488212

24. Shekar C, Cheluvaiah MB, Namile D. Prevalence of dental caries and dental fluorosis among 12 and 15 years old school children in relation to fluoride concentration in drinking water in an endemic fluoride belt of Andhra Pradesh. Indian J Public Health. 2012 Apr;56(2):122-8.

PubMed: PM22910620



Economic Evaluations

- 25. Atkins CY, Thomas TK, Lenaker D, Day GM, Hennessy TW, Meltzer MI. Cost-effectiveness of preventing dental caries and full mouth dental reconstructions among Alaska Native children in the Yukon-Kuskokwim delta region of Alaska. J Public Health Dent [Internet]. 2016 Jun [cited 2017 Mar 19];76(3):228-40. Available from: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC5010502 PubMed: PM26990678
- 26. McLaren L, McNeil DA, Potestio M, Patterson S, Thawer S, Faris P, et al. Equity in children's dental caries before and after cessation of community water fluoridation: differential impact by dental insurance status and geographic material deprivation. Int J Equity Health [Internet]. 2016 Feb 11 [cited 2017 Mar 19];15:24. Available from: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4750250
 PubMed: PM26864565
- O'Connell J, Rockell J, Ouellet J, Tomar SL, Maas W. Costs and savings associated with community water fluoridation in the United States. Health Aff (Millwood). 2016 Dec 1;35(12):2224-32.

PubMed: PM27920310

 Ran T, Chattopadhyay SK, Community Preventive Services Task Force. Economic evaluation of community water fluoridation: a community guide systematic review. Am J Prev Med. 2016 Jun;50(6):790-6.

PubMed: PM26776927

- Fyfe C, Borman B, Scott G, Birks S. A cost effectiveness analysis of community water fluoridation in New Zealand. N Z Med J. 2015 Dec 18;128(1427):38-46.
 PubMed: PM26914003
- Tchouaket E, Brousselle A, Fansi A, Dionne PA, Bertrand E, Fortin C. The economic value of Quebec's water fluoridation program. Z Gesundh Wiss [Internet]. 2013 [cited 2017 Mar 24];21(6):523-33. Available from: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3837190

PubMed: PM24293810

31. Kroon J, Van Wyk PJ. A model to determine the economic viability of water fluoridation. J Public Health Dent. 2012;72(4):327-33.

PubMed: PM22554069

 Marino R, Fajardo J, Morgan M. Cost-effectiveness models for dental caries prevention programmes among Chilean schoolchildren. Community Dent Health. 2012 Dec;29(4):302-8.

PubMed: PM23488214



Appendix — Further Information

Previous CADTH Reports

- 33. Fluoridated water for cavity prevention: a review of the clinical effectiveness, cost effectiveness, and guidelines [Internet]. Ottawa: CADTH; 2009 May [cited 2017 Mar 19]. (Rapid response: summary with critical appraisal). Available from: https://www.cadth.ca/fluoridated-water-cavity-prevention-review-clinical-effectiveness-cost-effectiveness-and-guideline-0
- 34. Fluoridated water for cavity prevention: clinical and cost effectiveness and guidelines [Internet]. Ottawa: CADTH; 2009 Apr [cited 2017 Mar 19]. (Rapid response: reference list). Available from: https://www.cadth.ca/fluoridated-water-cavity-prevention-clinical-and-cost-effectiveness-and-guidelines

Non-Randomized Studies

Fluoridation Unspecified/Natural Fluoridation

35. Aravind A, Dhanya RS, Narayan A, Sam G, Adarsh VJ, Kiran M. Effect of fluoridated water on intelligence in 10-12-year-old school children. J Int Soc Prev Community Dent. 2016 Dec;6(Suppl 3):S237-S242.

PubMed: PM28217543

36. Duan L, Zhu J, Wang K, Zhou G, Yang Y, Cui L, et al. Does fluoride affect serum testosterone and androgen binding protein with age-specificity? A population-based cross-sectional study in Chinese male farmers. Biol Trace Elem Res. 2016 Dec;174(2):294-9.

PubMed: PM27154732

37. Shekar C, Cheluvaiah MB, Namile D. Prevalence of dental caries and dental fluorosis among 12 and 15 years old school children in relation to fluoride concentration in drinking water in an endemic fluoride belt of Andhra Pradesh. Indian J Public Health. 2012 Apr;56(2):122-8.

PubMed: PM22910620

Review Articles

- Hooker C, Capon A, Leask J. Communicating about risk: strategies for situations where public concern is high but the risk is low. Public Health Res Pract. 2017 Jan 15;27(1). <u>PubMed: PM28243675</u>
- Zhang LE, Huang D, Yang J, Wei X, Qin J, Ou S, et al. Probabilistic risk assessment of Chinese residents' exposure to fluoride in improved drinking water in endemic fluorosis areas. Environ Pollut. 2017 Mar;222:118-25.
 PubMed: PM28063715
- 40. O'Mullane DM, Baez RJ, Jones S, Lennon MA, Peterson PE, Rugg-Gunn AJ, et al. Fluoride and oral health. Community Dent Health [Internet]. 2016 Jun [cited 2017 Mar 19];33(2):69-99. Available from:
 - http://www.who.int/oral_health/publications/2016_fluoride_oral_health.pdf?ua=1.



 Patel J, Durey A, Hearn L, Slack-Smith LM. Oral health interventions in Australian Aboriginal communities: a review of the literature. Aust Dent J. 2016 Dec 20. [Epub ahead of print].

PubMed: PM27997996

 Carey CM. Focus on fluorides: update on the use of fluoride for the prevention of dental caries. J Evid Based Dent Pract. 2014 Jun;14 Suppl:95-102.
 PubMed: PM24929594

Rugg-Gunn AJ, Do L. Effectiveness of water fluoridation in caries prevention.
 Community Dent Oral Epidemiol. 2012 Oct;40 Suppl 2:55-64.
 PubMed: PM22998306

Additional References

- 44. Improving oral health: community water fluoridation toolkit [Internet]. London: Public Health England; 2016 Mar [cited 2017 Mar 24]. Available from: https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/improving-oral-health-community-water-fluoridation-toolkit
- Botchey SA, Ouyang J, Vivekanantham S. Global water fluoridation: what is holding us back? Altern Ther Health Med. 2015 May;21(3):46-52.
 PubMed: PM26026144
- 46. Malin AJ, Till C. Exposure to fluoridated water and attention deficit hyperactivity disorder prevalence among children and adolescents in the United States: an ecological association. Environ Health. 2015 Feb 27;14:17. <u>PubMed: PM25890329</u>
- 47. Young N, Newton J, Morris J, Morris J, Langford J, Iloya J, et al. Community water fluoridation and health outcomes in England: a cross-sectional study. Community Dent Oral Epidemiol. 2015 Dec;43(6):550-9.

 PubMed: PM26153549
- 48. Water fluoridation: health monitoring report for England 2014 [Internet]. London: Public Health England; 2014 [cited 2017 Mar 24]. Available from: https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/water-fluoridation-health-monitoring-report-for-england-2014
- 49. Division of Oral Health, National Centre for Chronic Disease Prevention and Health Promotion. Cost savings of community water fluoridation [Internet]. Atlanta (GA): Centers for Disease Control and Prevention; 2013 Jul [cited 2017 Mar 24]. Available from: https://www.cdc.gov/fluoridation/statistics/cost.htm.